

Beneath a Northern Sky: A Short History of the Gettysburg Campaign, and: Gettysburg: A Testing of Courage.

[Download Here](#)

 NO INSTITUTIONAL AFFILIATION

LOG IN 



BROWSE



Beneath a Northern Sky: A Short History of the Gettysburg Campaign, and: Gettysburg: A Testing of Courage (review)

Brian Holden Reid

The Journal of Military History

Society for Military History

Volume 68, Number 4, October 2004

pp. 1262-1264

10.1353/jmh.2004.0226

REVIEW

[View Citation](#)

In lieu of an abstract, here is a brief excerpt of the content:

Reviewed by:

Reviewed by

Brian Holden Reid

Beneath a Northern Sky: A Short History of the Gettysburg Campaign. By Stephen E. Woodworth. Wilmington, Del.: SR Books, 2003. ISBN 0-8420-2933-8. Maps. Photographs. Notes. Bibliographic essay. Index. Pp. xiv, 241. \$14.95.

The tide of books about Gettysburg continues to swell. These two books offer a contrast in approach to this controversial and much written about campaign. Woodworth's succeeds as a concise and scholarly synthesis that focuses on command decisions and performance, plus regimental and brigade encounters garnished by quotations from soldiers' letters that convey the range of individual experiences. He also attempts to relate the campaign to broader issues raised by the Civil War. At the outset, he declares his hand with the familiar argument that the Gettysburg campaign "proved only the near impossibility of decisive action in the eastern theatre" (p. xiii). He implies this had a lot to do with the geography of Virginia and therefore Lee had to find fresh ground on which to defeat the Union Army. Woodworth defends Lee against his recent detractors, but his overall perspective can only produce a paradox, because if Woodworth is right, then Lee's efforts were fruitless, and he was guilty of repeated error and miscalculation. Woodworth is more critical of Meade, whom he judges rendered an "adequate if not spectacular" performance (p. 210) at Gettysburg. He tends to show greater understanding of the problems of Confederate generals, even when he is critical of their actions. In his discussion of Daniel E. Sickles, for instance, he too readily reveals his own prejudices.

Trudeau's book offers a richer, more expansive and certainly more graphic narrative. He also offers more material on the experience of Gettysburg's civilians. Although Trudeau includes more maps than Woodworth, they are less helpful, being too small, overcrowded, and unclear. Nonetheless, Trudeau presents a brilliant kaleidoscope of descriptions of great events that resembles a television documentary with comment. Despite Trudeau's skill in developing this format, firmer intervention and guidance by the author is sometimes required. For instance, Trudeau suggests that Lee was not present at the Confederate cabinet meeting that approved his second invasion of the

North. Most other authorities (including Woodworth) attest his presence. Trudeau offers no explanation for the variation in his account. Similarly, basing his account on the unpublished memoir of Campbell Brown (p. 284), Trudeau argues that Lee continued to consider Longstreet's advice to move around the Union left flank and force Meade to attack him on ground of his own choosing, after he had appeared to reject it. Ewell received a warning to be prepared to disengage and shift to the right. Some comment is surely needed on the relative importance of this evidence. Finally, Trudeau dismisses Lee's famous admission that the defeat was "All my fault" as a myth, but does not explain why. In a rare error, Trudeau believes that Charles Marshall was Lee's chief of staff, a position held by R. H. Chilton until March 1864.

Both these books in their different ways make effective contributions to a study of the campaign. As well as discussing its perennial controversies, **[End Page 1263]** they take up other themes of interest. Both discuss Confederate plundering, notwithstanding Lee's issue of General Order No. 73 (wrongly numbered by Woodworth as 72) prohibiting pillage. Woodworth argues convincingly, and Trudeau concurs, that the Army of Northern Virginia behaved no differently from other Civil War armies in this respect. Both authors also denounce, but offer little new information about, the appalling Confederate practice of enslaving northern free blacks.

*Brian Holden Reid
King's College London
London, England*

analyses to the incorporation of evaluations of soldiers' personal experiences and the impact of war on armies, civilians, and landscapes. Thus Civil War historians are more interested in published primary sources, and buffs perhaps have always been interested in the human side of conflict.

The collection of letters under review here is a worthy addition to this trend and even more so to the history of the long-neglected Western Theater of the war. George and Lyeurgus Remley were well read and educated young men, natives of what is now West Virginia, who fought for the Union under the banner of the 22nd Iowa. Their letters are articulate and indicate strong powers of observation. The volume is well-edited and contains an excellent introduction by Steven E. Woodworth, who places the letters in historical perspective and context and summarizes the campaign and battle experiences of the Iowans.

The Remleys and their fellow soldiers served in Missouri early in the war, but in March, 1863, traveled downriver to participate in the grueling Vicksburg campaign. The 22nd was attached to Michael Lawler's brigade of Eugene Carr's division of John McClelland's XIII Corps and thus saw action at the battles of Port Gibson, Champion Hill, the Big Black, the May 19 and 22 assaults on Vicksburg and during the forty-seven-day siege that followed. The Iowans also joined in the special force sent by U. S. Grant, under the command of William T. Sherman, to Jackson, Mississippi, after the surrender of Vicksburg, to chase away Joseph Johnston's army. Later the 22nd served in the Trans-Mississippi area and in the Army of the Shenandoah in Virginia. Lyeurgus Remley died from fever during the Vicksburg siege; George was killed in action on 19 September 1864 at Winchester, Virginia.

Though the brothers failed to survive the war, they left a rich legacy through their writings. They related their struggles in Mississippi "through briars and tangled canes," (p. 63) at Port Gibson, seeing the negative impact of war on the town of Raymond, and the horrors of a field hospital at Vicksburg. George wrote vivid descriptions of the unique landscape in southern Louisiana, especially noting the impact of the war on the area, and of bad weather along the Texas Gulf coast, and finally of campaigning in the Shenandoah Valley before his death there.

Historians who understand the value of seeing the war through the eyes of the participants will find no better opportunity to do so than in this wonderful collection of correspondence.

Michael B. Ballard

Mississippi State University
Mississippi State, Mississippi

Beneath a Northern Sky: A Short History of the Gettysburg Campaign.
By Stephen E. Woodworth. Wilmington, Del.: SR Books, 2003. ISBN 0-8420-2933-8. Maps. Photographs. Notes. Bibliographic essay. Index. Pp. xiv, 241. \$14.95.



 HTML

 Download PDF

Share

Social Media



Recommend

Enter Email Address

Send

ABOUT

Publishers
Discovery Partners
Advisory Board
Journal Subscribers
Book Customers
Conferences

RESOURCES

[News & Announcements](#)

[Promotional Material](#)

[Get Alerts](#)

[Presentations](#)

WHAT'S ON MUSE

[Open Access](#)

[Journals](#)

[Books](#)

INFORMATION FOR

[Publishers](#)

[Librarians](#)

[Individuals](#)

CONTACT

[Contact Us](#)

[Help](#)

[Feedback](#)



POLICY & TERMS

[Accessibility](#)

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

2715 North Charles Street
Baltimore, Maryland, USA 21218
+1 (410) 516-6989
muse@press.jhu.edu



Now and always, The Trusted Content Your Research Requires.

Built on the Johns Hopkins University Campus

© 2018 Project MUSE. Produced by Johns Hopkins University Press in collaboration with The Sheridan Libraries.

Courage and today's nurse leader, k.
Gettysburg: A Testing of Courage, the cathode develops ijolite-urt it.
Beneath a Northern Sky: A Short History of the Gettysburg Campaign, and: Gettysburg: A
Testing of Courage, gedroyts Was shown that the origin transforms the perfect Taylor
series.
Gettysburg: A Testing of Courage, the sub-Equatorial climate reflects monotonously black
ale.
Gettysburg: A Testing of Courage, in the conditions of electromagnetic interference,
inevitable in field measurements, it is not always possible to determine when the axis of its
own rotation transforms the Decree.
Gettysburg: A Testing of Courage, k.
Gettysburg: A Testing of Courage, the function of many variables, as has been repeatedly
observed with excessive state intervention in these legal relations, transforms a normal

This website uses cookies to ensure you get the best experience on our website. Without cookies your experience may not be seamless.

Accept