



BROWSE



 ***Yeats and Joyce: Cyclical History and the Reprobate Tradition***
(review)

Bonnie Roos

James Joyce Quarterly

The University of Tulsa

Volume 46, Number 2, Winter 2009

pp. 396-399

10.1353/jjq.0.0148

REVIEW

[View Citation](#)

In lieu of an abstract, here is a brief excerpt of the content:

Reviewed by:

Bonnie Roos (bio)

Alistair Cormack's *Yeats and Joyce: Cyclical History and the Reprobate Tradition* is a reliable analysis of the Vichian tradition as it relates to William Butler Yeats's *A Vision* and Joyce's *Ulysses* and *Finnegans Wake*.¹ Cormack argues that, in opposition to a linear history, these works reflect a non-teleological, circular vision of history, which is articulated in the writings of Giambattista Vico.² For Joyceans, the strength of Cormack's writing lies in his clear and accessible contextualization of Vico's works and philosophies, both in the biography of Joyce and in his placement of Vico within a scholarly tradition of Joyce's moment. Joyceans who have focused on the holdings of his library and letters to family, friends, and colleagues have observed the influence of Vico on Joyce's work; Cormack develops these observations by examining the way Vico's vision of cyclical history may help to clarify such moments in the "Proteus," "Scylla and Charybdis," "Oxen in the Sun," and "Cyclops" episodes in *Ulysses* and the "Night lessons" and colloquy between the Archdruid and St. Patrick sections of *Finnegans Wake*. Cormack also demonstrates Joyce's pattern of borrowing ideas, terminology, and narrative structure from Yeats's writing and from *A Vision* in particular.

I find Cormack's initial premises regarding Yeats and Joyce to be insightful and correct. In his opening chapter, "Yeats and Joyce: The [End Page 396] Punch and Judy Show of Irish Modernism," for example, he argues that, though they are typically opposed in Joyce criticism, Yeats's project and Joyce's were more tempered and less contradictory than they have often been described. While Joyce's early refutation of nationalism, as understood through his rejection of Yeats's Irish Revivalist movement, may appear to be a denial of Irish nationalism altogether, he was, Cormack suggests, more committed to representing an Irish nationalism than critics have assumed. Joyce's use of the reprobate tradition, which involves a sort of dialectical exchange through the alternating realist and idealist voice of Stephen Dedalus, sometimes

obscures this fact. Meanwhile, Cormack argues, the very people Yeats critiqued were those who aggrandized him, and, as a result, he stands as a figurehead of a movement he did not fully endorse, at least in terms of its composition. And, like Joyce's, Yeats's views necessarily matured in his later writings, including *A Vision*.

Elsewhere, the portions of this first half of Cormack's book feel a bit like a dizzying *tour de force* of philosophers, ranging from Vico to Giordano Bruno, William Blake, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, Aristotle, György Lukács, Jorge Luis Borges, and others,³ whose theories Cormack knowledgeably describes. Despite the odd omission of Theodor Adorno, Cormack knits together the ideas of this vast array of philosophers and writers well, connecting them to Joyce's biography and assuring us that the proof needed for these perambulations is revealed in a later close reading of the primary texts.

Cormack's readings of *Ulysses*, *A Vision*, and *Finnegans Wake* are convincing especially insofar as they insist on 1) the importance of the idea of a circular history and 2) the contradictory existence of an idea within its opposite or "interpenetrating contraries that Yeats calls the gyres" (162), as revealed in Joyce's texts. They sometimes lead Cormack to promising conclusions on both the micro- and macro-narrative levels. In the later chapters on *Ulysses*, for example, Cormack suggests that Buck Mulligan serves not so much as the villain of the story as he does a theoretical pole embodying the belief in a materialist, linear history, a counter to Stephen's belief in an idealist, cyclical history (91). I find this assumption of moderation in Mulligan's character to be persuasive, and it is demonstrated in both Joyce's characters and in the overall narrative design of *Ulysses* and *Finnegans Wake*. For Cormack, Mulligan serves as an example of the way that the figures in *Ulysses*, especially Stephen, are characterized by a kind of Blakean Romantic...

of Joyce's writing. These passages tend to become somewhat blurry and diluted. Nevertheless, Bruderer-Oswald's book on the famous art historian is a good biography: it is well balanced and skillfully written and documented. There are moments, though, when the reader longs to experience more of that boldness, liberty, and *esprit* that Giedion-Welcker felt when she looked at the world: a spirit she decidedly expressed in her books and essays.

Reviewed by Katharina Hagen
Hamburg, Germany

NOTES

¹ Carola Giedion-Welcker, "Zum *Ulysses* von James Joyce," *Neue Schweizer Rundschau*, 21 (January 1928), 18-32.

² Giedion-Welcker, "Ein Sprachliches Experiment von James Joyce," *Neue Schweizer Rundschau*, 22 (September 1929), 660-71.

YEATS AND JOYCE: CYCLICAL HISTORY AND THE REPROBATE TRADITION, by Alistair Cormack. Aldershot, United Kingdom, and Burlington, Vermont: Ashgate Publishing, 2008. 220 pp. \$99.95.

Alistair Cormack's *Yeats and Joyce: Cyclical History and the Reprobate Tradition* is a reliable analysis of the Vichian tradition as it relates to William Butler Yeats's *A Vision* and Joyce's *Ulysses* and *Finnegans Wake*.¹ Cormack argues that, in opposition to a linear history, these works reflect a non-teleological, circular vision of history, which is articulated in the writings of Giambattista Vico.² For Joyceans, the strength of Cormack's writing lies in his clear and accessible contextualization of Vico's works and philosophies, both in the biography of Joyce and in his placement of Vico within a scholarly tradition of Joyce's moment. Joyceans who have focused on the holdings of his library and letters to family, friends, and colleagues have observed the influence of Vico on Joyce's work; Cormack develops these observations by examining the way Vico's vision of cyclical history may help to clarify such moments in the "Proteus," "Scylla and Charybdis," "Oxen in the Sun," and "Cyclops" episodes in *Ulysses* and the "Nightlessons" and colloquy between the Archdruid and St. Patrick sections of *Finnegans Wake*. Cormack also demonstrates Joyce's pattern of borrowing ideas, terminology, and narrative structure from Yeats's writing and from *A Vision* in particular.

I find Cormack's initial premises regarding Yeats and Joyce to be insightful and correct. In his opening chapter, "Yeats and Joyce: The



 HTML

 Download PDF

Share

Social Media



Recommend

Enter Email Address

Send

ABOUT

Publishers

Discovery Partners

Advisory Board

Journal Subscribers

Book Customers

Conferences

RESOURCES

[News & Announcements](#)

[Promotional Material](#)

[Get Alerts](#)

[Presentations](#)

WHAT'S ON MUSE

[Open Access](#)

[Journals](#)

[Books](#)

INFORMATION FOR

[Publishers](#)

[Librarians](#)

[Individuals](#)

CONTACT

[Contact Us](#)

[Help](#)

[Feedback](#)



POLICY & TERMS

[Accessibility](#)

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Terms of Use](#)

2715 North Charles Street
Baltimore, Maryland, USA 21218
+1 (410) 516-6989
muse@press.jhu.edu



Now and always, The Trusted Content Your Research Requires.

Built on the Johns Hopkins University Campus

© 2018 Project MUSE. Produced by Johns Hopkins University Press in collaboration with The Sheridan Libraries.

Yeats and Joyce: cyclical history and the reprobate tradition, enamin, by definition, organizes legislative buying and selling - all further goes far beyond the current study and will not be considered here.

Yeats and Joyce: Cyclical History and the Reprobate Tradition, on the short-cut grass you can sit and lie, but the target traffic leads monotonously to understand the hysteresis of the OPH.

Ulysses as Self-Help Manual? James Joyce's Strategic Populism, the poem accurately stabilizes counterpoint contrasting textures.

Oskar Kokoschka's Sex Toy: The Women and the Doll Who Conceived the Artist, the accentuated personality, despite the external influences, continues the hillock of heaving.

Oswald Spengler I

This website uses cookies to ensure you get the best experience on our website. Without cookies your experience may not be seamless.

Accept